Disentangling North Atlantic ocean-atmosphere coupling using circulation

2	analogues
3	Author One ^a
4	^a First Affiliation

⁵ *Corresponding author*: Author One, email@email.com

ABSTRACT: The coupled nature of the ocean-atmosphere system frequently makes understanding 6 the chain of causality difficult in ocean-atmosphere interactions. This study presents a method to 7 remove the component of turbulent heat fluxes which is directly forced by atmospheric circulation, 8 diagnosing the residual as being primarily 'ocean-forced'. This method is applied to the North 9 Atlantic in a 500-year pre-industrial control run using the Met Office's HadGEM3-GC3.1-MM 10 model. The method identifies residual heat flux modes associated with variations in ocean circula-11 tion and shows that these force equivalent barotropic circulation anomalies in the atmosphere. The 12 first of these modes is characterised by the ocean warming the atmosphere along the Gulf Stream 13 and North Atlantic Current and the second by a dipole of cooling in the western subtropical North 14 Atantic and warming in the sub-polar North Atlantic. These results tentatively suggest that the Gulf 15 Stream may play a role in the circulation response to decadal ocean variability. More generally, this 16 method provides a useful way to separate-out causality in ocean-atmosphere interactions which 17 could easily be applied to other ocean basins. and to models or reanalysis datasets. 18

19 1. Introduction

The impact of extratropical sea surface temperature (SST) variability on atmospheric circulation is both a complex theoretical problem and an eminently practical one. It is a practical problem in that ocean variability is a major source of prediction skill for forecasts on sub-seasonal to decadal timescales (Meehl et al. 2021; Merryfield et al. 2020).

North Atlantic Ocean variability is thought to be an important source of climate predictability on 24 decadal and longer timescales (Zhang et al. 2019). For example, Atlantic Multidecadal Variability 25 (AMV) has been linked to variability in the position of the Intertropical Convergence Zone (ITCZ) 26 and Sahel rainfall (Knight et al. 2006), multidecadal Atlantic hurricane activity (Sutton and Hodson 27 2007) and European climate (Sutton and Dong 2012; O'Reilly et al. 2017). On seasonal timescales, 28 North Atlantic SST anomalies also plays some role in forcing the North Atlantic Oscillation (NAO) 29 (Rodwell et al. 1999; Mehta et al. 2000; Czaja and Frankignoul 2002; Gastineau et al. 2013; Dong 30 et al. 2013; Baker et al. 2019). 31

On the theoretical side, identifying the role of the mid-latitude SSTs in atmospheric variability presents a challenge because of the coupled nature of the ocean-atmosphere system and the relatively weak influence of the ocean on the atmosphere (Kushnir et al. 2002). On interannual and shorter timescales the atmosphere governs ocean-atmosphere covariability via modulation of air temperature, specific humidity and near-surface wind speed, and these in turn modify surface turbulent heat fluxes (Q). At decadal timescales and longer, the ocean dominates as it integrates atmospheric variability and responds via changes to ocean circulation and ocean heat transport.

Idealised modelling studies have found that the initial response to a warm mid-latitude SST anomaly consists of a linear baroclinic response, with a downstream surface low advecting cool air equatorwards to balance the heating (Hoskins and Karoly 1981; Hendon and Hartmann 1982). After around ten days, the response becomes dominated by an equivalent barotropic pattern, involving transient eddy feedbacks, with the anomalous circulation extending far beyond the initial perturbation (Deser et al. 2007). The equivalent barotropic response typically projects strongly onto the dominant modes of internal variability such as the NAO.

The circulation response to mid-latitude SSTs is substantially model dependent and is sensitive to the location of the heating relative to the mean jet. Modelled circulation responses to midlatitude SSTs are also weak in comparison to both tropical SST-induced anomalies and internal, ⁴⁹ mid-latitude variability (Kushnir et al. 2002). However, models' responses to mid-latitude SST
⁵⁰ variability are likely too weak (Eade et al. 2014; Scaife and Smith 2018; Smith et al. 2020), possibly
⁵¹ due to low horizontal resolution (Scaife et al. 2019) or weak eddy feedbacks (Hardiman et al. 2022).
⁵² Relatedly, models underestimate the magnitude of decadal to multidecadal extratropical variability
⁵³ of circulation, particularly for the North Atlantic (Simpson et al. 2018; O'Reilly et al. 2021).

To identify SST-forcing of atmospheric circulation, studies use a variety of methods. These include 1) low-pass filtering data to isolate timescales at which the ocean dominates, 2) using lagged correlation analysis and 3) performing atmosphere-only experiments. However, as discussed above, current models are deficient at capturing the response to mid-latitude SSTs. Moreover, the shortness of the observed record means that low-pass filtering gives only a few degrees of freedom, while lagged correlation analysis of a short time series can be hard to interpet.

This study presents a method to separate the ocean-forced component of Q from the circulation-60 forced component. The method has been designed such that it does not require any low-pass filtering 61 and can be applied to both models and reanalysis data. In this study the method is only applied to 62 model data as this provides a more controlled setup in which there is a long data record and there 63 is no observational uncertainty associated with variables such as Q. Testing with reanalysis data 64 is reserved for a future paper. The method involves the use of circulation analogues to identify 65 the component of Q directly associated with circulation variability, diagnosing the ocean-forced 66 component as the residual. We apply this method to a 500-year pre-industrial control (piControl) 67 run with no external forcing, before applying it to simulations of the same model with observed 68 external forcings from 1850 to 2014. 69

The datasets and method are described in section 2 before the method is applied to a piControl simulation in section 3. The leading modes of the decomposition are examined in section 4, followed by an analysis of the circulation responses to the Q modes in section 5 and discussion of the sensivity to the presence of external forcing and length of the dataset in section 6. Finally, some discussion and conclusions are provided in section 7.

75 **2. Data and methods**

76 a. Data

We analyse simulations using the UK Met Office HadGEM3-GC31 model (Williams et al. 2018) 77 for which North Atlantic ocean-atmosphere coupling has been extensively analysed (e.g. Lai et al. 78 2022; Khatri et al. 2022). The model consists of coupled ocean, atmosphere, land and sea-ice 79 models. In this study, we primarily utilize the run with medium (MM) resolution in the ocean 80 and atmosphere, but also briefly analyse the low (LL) resolution version. The 'LL' and 'MM' 81 simulations are performed on N96 (grid-spacing of approximately 125km) and N216 (grid-spacing 82 of approximately 60km) grids in the atmosphere, respectively. The horizontal ocean resolution 83 is 0.25° (ORCA025) in 'MM' and 1° (ORCA1) in 'LL' but with a resolution of 0.33° from 15N 84 to 15S. Both 'LL' and 'MM' have 75 vertical levels in the ocean and 85 in the atmosphere. The 85 piControl runs using both versions of the model simulate AMV with a 60-80 year period, consistent 86 with observations, however the versions differ in terms of their ocean circulation variability and 87 atmospheric response to AMV (Lai et al. 2022). Both versions show a slightly weaker Atlantic 88 Meridional Overturning Circulation (AMOC) at 26.5N and at sub-polar latitudes with respect to 89 RAPID (Menary et al. 2018) and OSNAP observations (Menary et al. 2020), respectively. 90

91 b. Circulation analogues

In order to attribute *Q* anomalies to atmospheric or oceanic forcing, we apply a circulation analogues method similar to that used by Deser et al. (2016) and O'Reilly et al. (2017). The concept of comparing similar circulation states was first developed in the context of statistical weather prediction by Lorenz (1969) and later van den Dool (1994) and van den Dool et al. (2003). More recently, it has been used to study the degree to which atmospheric circulation trends have played a role in observed temperature trends (Cattiaux et al. 2010; Wallace et al. 2012; Deser et al. 2016).

The circulation analogues method attempts to estimate the component of a temporally and spatially varying variable, that is directly associated with changes in atmospheric circulation. In our case, we decompose Q into two components,

$$Q = Q_{CIRC} + Q_{RESIDUAL},\tag{1}$$

where Q_{CIRC} is the circulation-related component of Q and $Q_{RESIDUAL}$, is the residual. We interpret the $Q_{RESIDUAL}$ to be predominantly ocean-forced. In principal, $Q_{RESIDUAL}$ will also vary due to radiative warming of the atmosphere, for example through externally forced radiative changes. There is no external forcing in the piControl run, but we remove the effects of external forcing when applying the method to historical simulations by regressing out the global-mean SST. This is discussed further in section 14. We also perform a linear detrending of piControl anomalies prior to reconstructing SLP, in order to remove any drifts in the model.

Our method begins by taking the linearly detrended, monthly-mean sea level pressure (SLP) 109 anomalies for a particular month, say January 1901, and calculating the Euclidian distance between 110 this month and all other Januaries over the North Atlantic region. Note that each month is only 111 compared to its corresponding month (Januaries with Januaries etc), hence removing the seasonal 112 cycle. A sub-sample of size N_r from the N_s most similar Januaries is then taken and this sample of 113 anomaly maps is used to reconstruct the original (January 1901) anomaly field via a multiple linear 114 regression, over a particular region. This gives a set of N_r weights for each of the sub-sampled 115 months. Q_{CIRC} is then calculated by summing the Q anomalies for the same years multiplied 116 by the corresponding weights calculated for the SLP anomalies. The resampling procedure is 117 repeated N_a times to obtain N_a reconstructions of SLP and Q_{CIRC} , which are then averaged to 118 find a best estimate. In practice, N_r , N_s and N_a are taken to be 50, 80 and 100, respectively. This 119 entire process is then repeated for all years in the dataset and for all calendar months of interest. 120 For instance, if the December-January-February-March (DJFM) mean is required, the method is 121 applied independently for December, January, February and March, before taking the average of 122 these reconstructions. 123

Applying the process separately to individual months before taking the seasonal average is a 129 critical part of the procedure as this allows for the possibility of SSTs influencing atmospheric 130 circulation on sub-seasonal timescales. The point of the decomposition is to remove the direct 131 influence that atmospheric circulation has on Q; for instance, through modulation of surface 132 wind speed or the air-sea temperature difference. This downward influence is strongest when the 133 circulation leads the Q by 10-20 days (figure 1a, Deser and Timlin 1997). The autocorrelation 134 timescale of the atmosphere is on the order of 2-4 weeks, in contrast to SST anomalies which persist 135 for many months (figure 1b). Consequently, SST anomalies created by stochastic atmospheric 136



FIG. 1. a) Lagged cross-correlation of the NAO, calculated as the first principal component (PC) SLP anomalies, 20N-70N, 60W-0E, with the first principal component time series of SST, calculated over the same area for boreal winter (December-January-February-March). b) The autocorrelation of the NAO and SST PC time series'. The NAO is calculated using data from ERA5 (Hersbach et al. 2020) and the SST dataset is HadISST 2.1 (Titchner and Rayner 2014).

¹³⁷ forcing in the early winter may then exert an influence on the atmosphere through to late winter.
¹³⁸ On the other hand, idealised experiments show that the atmospheric circulation response to mid¹³⁹ latitude SST anomalies takes several months to fully develop (Ferreira and Frankignoul 2005; Deser
¹⁴⁰ et al. 2007). Therefore, applying the method to monthly-mean data allows for circulation anomalies
¹⁴¹ to develop in response to SST anomalies induced by atmospheric forcing in prior months.

The method is therefore not an attempt to completely separate the total influence of atmospheric circulation on Q, as circulation may first influence SSTs and subsequently Q. Rather, the dynamical decomposition is a diagnostic tool to measure the SST-driven component of Q and consequently, establish how patterns of SST variability affect atmospheric circulation.

¹⁴⁶ *c. Linear decomposition of Q anomalies*

¹⁴⁷ Q is composed of sensible (Q_S) and latent heating (Q_L) terms which can be represented using the ¹⁴⁸ bulk formulae $Q_L = \rho C_p L U \Delta H$ and $Q_S = \rho C_p C_H U \Delta T$, respectively. Here, ρ is the air density, U¹⁴⁹ is the near-surface wind speed, C_p is the heat capacity of water, L is the latent heat of evaporation ¹⁵⁰ and C_E and C_H are transfer coefficients. $\Delta H = H_s - H_a$ and $\Delta T = T_s - T_a$ are the air-sea temperature ¹⁵¹ and specific humidity differences, respectively. Here subscript *s* represents the sea surface and *a*, ¹⁵² the atmosphere.

A linear decomposition of Q (e.g. Alexander and Scott 1997; Du and Xie 2008; He et al. 2022) yields

$$\Delta Q' = \Delta Q'_S + \Delta Q'_L \approx (\overline{Q_S} + \overline{Q_L}) \frac{U'}{\overline{U}} + \overline{Q_S} \frac{\Delta T'}{\overline{\Delta T}} + \overline{Q_L} \frac{\Delta H'}{\overline{\Delta H}},$$
(2)

where overbars represent time-mean quantities and primes are the anomalies with respect to the time-mean. This decomposition assumes that $U'\Delta H' << \overline{UH}$ and $U'\Delta T' << \overline{UT}$, which are both good approximations at the monthly timescale (not shown).

158 d. Indices

The NAO index is calculated as the first empirical orthogonal function (EOF) of DJFM-mean SLP over the region 20N-80N and 60W-0W, calculated using the python package 'eofs' (Dawson 2016). The AMOC index is defined, following Lai et al. (2022), as the Atlantic overturning stream function (in depth space) at 45N and 1000m depth. The AMV is calculated as the basin-mean North Atlantic SST (80W-0W, 0N-80N) after the global mean has been linearly removed from each grid-point. The index is then low-pass filtered using a 15-year running mean, again following Lai et al. (2022).

3. Applying to a piControl simulation

We now apply the circulation analogues method described in section 2 to the North Atlantic, over a box bounded by latitudes 20N-75N and longitudes 90W-0E (shown by the boxed region in figure 2). An example of the decomposition is shown in figure 2 for the winter (DJFM) of model year 1911 in the HadGEM3-GC31-MM piControl simulation. The circulation-related SLP field, marked by a postive-NAO like pattern, is by construction almost identical to the full field over the North Atlantic



FIG. 2. Dynamical decomposition of SLP and Q anomalies for the winter (DJFM) of the year 1911 in the HadGEM3-GC31-MM piControl run.

region (figure 2a,c), however this is not the case outside of the North Atlantic (figure 2e). The 174 Q anomalies (defined as positive upwards) indicate anomalously high heat loss from the ocean to 175 the atmosphere over a horseshoe-shaped region involving the sub-polar North Atlantic and eastern 176 sub-tropical North Atlantic (figure 2b). The dynamical decomposition suggests that a substantial 177 proportion of this is related to the circulation, including heat loss over the western sub-polar and 178 subtropical North Atlantic (figure 2d). $Q_{RESIDUAL}$ anomalies are of similar magnitude to Q_{CIRC} 179 anomalies and are characterised by ocean heat-loss over the eastern sub-polar and heat-gain over 180 the western subtropics, with a northward shift of the Gulf Stream (figure 2f). 181

¹⁸⁸ Much of the sub-polar heat-loss over the sub-polar North Atlantic in winter 1911 occurs in ¹⁸⁹ December and January (compare figure 3d,j with figure 3p,v). Strong near-surface wind speeds ¹⁹⁰ and air-sea temperature and specific humidity differences all contribute to the sub-polar heat-¹⁹¹ loss (figure 3a-c, g-i), which is largely driven by atmospheric circulation (figure 3e,k). In all ¹⁹² four months, $Q_{RESIDUAL}$ shows positive anomalies over the Gulf Stream and eastern sub-polar ¹⁹³ North Atlantic (figure 3f,l,r,x) with negative anomalies in the subtropics from January to March ¹⁹⁴ (figure 3l,r,x). The relative persistence of $Q_{RESIDUAL}$ compared to Q_{CIRC} across the winter, is



FIG. 3. Linear and dynamical decompositions of Q anomalies for the winter of model year 1911 in the piControl run. The different rows show results of the decompositions for a-f) December 1910, g-l) January 1911, m-r) February 1911 and s-x) March 1911. Columns show Q anomalies associated with a,g,m,s) surface-wind forcing, b,h,n,t) air-sea temperature differences, c,i,o,u) air-sea specific humidity differences, d,j,p,v) the sum of the first three columns, e,k,q,w) Q_{CIRC} and f,l,r,x) $Q_{RESIDUAL}$. Vectors in a,g,m,s) show 10m wind anomalies. *Q* anomalies are in units of Wm^{-2} .

¹⁹⁵ suggestive of the role of lower frequency SST variability in $Q_{RESIDUAL}$. Nevertheless, there are ¹⁹⁶ distinct $Q_{RESIDUAL}$ differences between each month, possibly due to atmospheric forcing from the ¹⁹⁷ previous month affecting SSTs.

To test the dynamical decomposition method more systematically, we calculate the correlation, 200 at each grid-point, between DJFM-mean SST anomalies and the components of the Q dynamical 201 decomposition. Consider that if a warm SST anomaly is primarily the result of warming by the 202 atmosphere, then the anomalous Q is negative, while a cool SST anomaly will be associated with 203 a positive upward heat flux anomaly. Conversely, if the SST anomaly is warming or cooling the 204 atmosphere, having formed through alterations to ocean circulation or by atmospheric forcing at 205 least a month or two previous, then the sign of the SST anomaly should be the same as that of 206 the anomalous heat flux. That is, a negative correlation between SST and Q anomalies indicates a 207 downward influence, while a positive correlation indicates an upward influence (e.g. Gulev et al. 208



FIG. 4. Grid-point correlations between SST anomalies and a) Q_{CIRC} , b) $Q_{RESIDUAL}$ and c) Q in the HadGEM3-GC1-MM piControl run.

2013; O'Reilly et al. 2016; Bishop et al. 2017; Blackport et al. 2019; O'Reilly et al. 2023). As 209 anticipated, the Q_{CIRC} component is negatively correlated with SST across the North Atlantic, 210 suggesting a primarily downward influence (figure 4a). In contrast, SSTs are positively correlated 211 with the $Q_{RESIDUAL}$ (figure 4b), suggesting a largely upward influence of Q anomalies. For 212 reference, the full Q field shows that over the extratropical North Atlantic, SST variability tends 213 to warm the atmosphere more so than the atmosphere warms the SSTs, whereas the influence is 214 generally downward in the tropical Atlantic (figure 4c). Unsurprisingly, Q variability in the Gulf 215 stream region stands out as being particularly dominated by the ocean (figure 4c, figure 5c). 216

The majority of modelled Q variability in the sub-polar North Atlantic and particularly the 220 Labrador Sea, is associated with Q_{CIRC} (figure 5a,c). This may be due to circulation modulating 221 the advection of cold air from the North American continent over the ocean, raising the air-sea 222 temperature constrast. Nevertheless, the $Q_{RESIDUAL}$ shows a similar magnitude of variability to 223 Q_{CIRC} along the North Atlantic Current (NAC) and larger variability associated with the Gulf 224 Stream region. Therefore, while Q_{CIRC} variability is larger over the sub-polar region, neither 225 component of the decomposition completely dominates the Q variability over the extratropical 226 North Atlantic. The next section examines the primary modes of Q variability associated with the 227 components of the Q decomposition and relates these to patterns of atmospheric circulation. 228



FIG. 5. Variance associated with interannual (DJFM) variability of components of the *Q* decomposition. Shown is the variance in a) Q_{CIRC} , b) $Q_{RESIDUAL}$ and c) the ratio of the variance of $Q_{RESIDUAL}$ to the variance in *Q*. Units for a,b) are both $(Wm^{-2})^2$ and c) is unitless.

4. Modes of *Q* variability

To understand the spatial patterns of variability associated with the Q decomposition, we perform 234 an area-weighted EOF analysis separately for Q, Q_{CIRC} and $Q_{RESIDUAL}$, over the same region 235 used to calculate the decomposition (20N-75N, 60W-0E). The EOFs 1 and 2 of both Q and Q_{CIRC} 236 are characterised by a tripole pattern (figure 6a,e), associated with the positive phase of the NAO 237 (figure 6c,g) and enhanced Q over the central North Atlantic (figure 6b,f), linked to the East Atlantic 238 Pattern (figure 6d,h), respectively. The first two EOFs of Q_{CIRC} explain more variance (EOF1: 239 34.5%, EOF2: 17.5%) than those of Q (EOF1: 25.0%, EOF2: 12.6%) because Q also includes 240 variability which is unrelated to atmospheric circulation. 241

EOF1 and EOF2 of $Q_{RESIDUAL}$ are more spatially localised, instead marked by anomalous 252 positive Q along the NAC (figure 6g) and positive Q anomalies to the south-east of Greenland, 253 with a weak negative anomaly in the subtropics. $Q_{RESIDUAL}$ EOF1 is somewhat reminiscent of 254 the 'slow' response at 3-4 year lags to NAO forcing found by Khatri et al. (2022) in using the same 255 model but with decadal hindcast data (c.f. their figure 2). They found that the initial 'fast' response 256 to the NAO caused by wind stress and Q anomalies is followed by a slower adjustment to SSTs 257 involving a strengthened overturning circulation, as shown in figure 7c). This is corroborated by 258 the fact that lagged correlations between the NAO and PC1 peak when the NAO leads by one year 259 (figure 7a). 260



FIG. 6. Leading modes of variability associated with the components of the Q decomposition. The first and second EOFs of a-d) Q, e-h) Q_{CIRC} and i-l) $Q_{RESIDUAL}$ are shown regressed onto a-b,e-f,i-j) Q and c-d,g-h,k-l) SLP. Hatching indicates where regression coefficients are statistically significant at the 95% level following a t-test. The boxed region indicates the region over which both the decomposition and EOFs are calculated.

Lagged correlation / regression analysis shows that the AMOC begins to strengthen about five years prior to the maximum of $Q_{RESIDUAL}$ PC1 (figures 7b, 8b). It is likely that this AMOC variability represents the integration of NAO variability over multiple years (e.g. O'Reilly et al. 2019). The signature of lower frequency, ocean variability is also seen in the power spectrum of $Q_{RESIDUAL}$ PC1, which has notable peaks for periods of 20 and 40 years, neither of which is seen for Q and Q_{CIRC} (figure 8c,d).

Interestingly, $Q_{RESIDUAL}$ PC2 shows a strengthened AMOC ten years before the PC2 peak (figures 7e), with the maximum $Q_{RESIDUAL}$ PC2-AMOC correlation occurring when the AMOC



FIG. 7. Lagged regression of $Q_{RESIDUAL}$ PC time series' associated with a-d) EOF1 and e-h) EOF2 with the Atlantic overturning stream function (colours) as a function of depth and latitude. The mean overturning stream function is shown by unfilled contours with contours drawn every 4Sv, beginning at 2Sv. Hatching indicates statistically significant where regression coefficients are statistically significant following a t-test. i) Shows results of a lagged correlation analysis between $Q_{RESIDUAL}$ PC1 and PC2 with PC1 leading at positive lags. Filled circles indicate statistically significant correlations following a t-test.

leads by 5-7 years (figure 8b). This is likely because $Q_{RESIDUAL}$ PC2 to some extent reflects a continuation of PC1, as the two are significantly correlated when PC1 leads by 3-10 years. Physically, warm SST anomalies associated with $Q_{RESIDUAL}$ PC1 propagate polewards towards the eastern sub-polar North Atlantic (figure 9) on timescales of 4-6 years. This timescale is roughly consistent with observations (Årthun and Eldevik 2016; Årthun et al. 2017) and analysis of an earlier version of HadGEM3 (Menary et al. 2015).

In summary, positive $Q_{RESIDUAL}$ PC1 events are preceded by positive NAO forcing in the previous years which cools the western sub-polar North Atlantic and warms the Gulf Stream region (as indicated by Q_{CIRC} in figure 9). These changes drive a stronger AMOC and warm SSTs along



FIG. 8. Lagged correlations for a) the NAO index with the AMOC and $Q_{RESIDUAL}$ PC1, b) the AMOC with $Q_{RESIDUAL}$ PC1 and PC2. Filled circles indicate statistically significant correlations following a t-test. Power spectra are also shown for the c) first and d) second principal components of Q (black), Q_{CIRC} (red) and $Q_{RESIDUAL}$ (blue).

the NAC (figure 7b,9). These SST anomalies force an Atlantic ridge response, which is investigated in the next section. The SST anomalies subsequently propagate towards the eastern sub-polar North Atlantic. $Q_{RESIDUAL}$ PC2 events follow $Q_{RESIDUAL}$ PC1 events 3-10 years later, with the North Atlantic now marked by warm sub-polar and cool Gulf Stream regions. This subsequently forces a negative NAO, which is also investigated in the next section.

5. Circulation response to heat flux anomalies

²⁹⁶ Both $Q_{RESIDUAL}$ PC1 and PC2 are correlated with SLP anomalies at zero lag, suggesting that ²⁹⁷ these are a response to the anomalous Q as the direct circulation-forced component of Q has been ²⁹⁸ removed from $Q_{RESIDUAL}$ by construction. $Q_{RESIDUAL}$ PC1, which is associated with positive



FIG. 9. Lagged regression with $Q_{RESIDUAL}$ PC1/PC2 with SST and SLP in colours and $Q_{RESIDUAL}$ and Q_{CIRC} shown by unfilled contours. For $Q_{RESIDUAL}$ and Q_{CIRC} , contours are only drawn for $\pm 3Wm^{-2}$ for visual clarity. Hatching indicates where SST / SLP regression coefficients are statistically significant at the 95% level following a t-test. The lagged cross-correlation between $Q_{RESIDUAL}$ PC1 and PC2 is also shown, with filled scatter points indicating that the correlations are statistically significant at the 95% level, also following a t-test.

SSTs along the NAC (figure 10a), forces a ridge between 40N and 60N, with an opposite-signed 299 anomaly east of Greenland (figure 6). This is also linked to an equivalent-barotropic northward 300 shift of the jet and strengthening of storm track activity in the western North Atlantic, measured 301 using transient heat transport, v'T', as a proxy (figure 10b,c). The primes indicate high-pass 302 filtering with a 10-day Lanczos filter (Duchon 1979). The increase in storm track activity is likely 303 driven by the increased SST gradient along the northern flank of the Gulf Stream (figure 10a) 304 and hence increased baroclinicity. The paradigm of Novak et al. (2015) suggests that periods of 305 high transient heat transport are associated with a higher frequency of downstream wave-breaking 306



FIG. 10. Diagnostics showing the circulation response to $Q_{RESIDUAL}$ a-d) EOF1 and e-h) EOF2. Shown are regressions of the $Q_{RESIDUAL}$ PC1 and PC2 indices with a,e) SSTs, b,f) 250hPa (colours) and 850hPa (unfilled contours) winds, c,g) 850hPa 10-day high pass filtered meridional heat transport at 850hPa, d,h) E vectors (vectors). Colours in d,h) indicate the divergence associated with those vectors. Unfilled contours in b,f) are contoured every $0.1ms^{-1}/\sigma$. Hatching indicates statistically significant where regression coefficients are statistically significant following a t-test.

on the southward side of the jet. This decelerates the jet on the equatorward flank and transfers 307 momentum poleward (as indicated by the divergence of E-vectors in figure 10d), deflecting the 308 jet polewards. In contrast, $Q_{RESIDUAL}$ PC2 forces a negative NAO-like pattern (figure 6) and an 309 equatorward shift of the eddy-driven jet. Understanding the response to PC2 is complicated by the 310 presence of two centres of action in the $Q_{RESIDUAL}$ pattern - one over the sub-polar North Atlantic 311 and another in the Gulf Stream region (figure 6j). The transient heat transport response for PC2 is 312 slightly weaker than for PC1, but it is possible that the cooler Gulf Stream in PC2 acts to shift the 313 jet southward via a similar mechanism to PC1 (but with signs reversed). 314

To further interrogate the relative importance of the different centres of action, we regress $Q_{RESIDUAL}$ and SLP onto the NAO and onto the mean $Q_{RESIDUAL}$ calculated over boxes in the eastern sub-polar (50N-60N,40W-20W), sub-tropical (25N-35N,55W-40W) and NAC (40N-50N,40W-30W) regions. The response to PC2 is NAO-like, hence it is surprising that the NAO-



FIG. 11. Regression analysis of the connection between SLP and $Q_{RESIDUAL}$ variability in the piControl run. Regression of the NAO index onto a) SLP and e) $Q_{RESIDUAL}$. The other panels show regression of b-d) SLP and f-h) $Q_{RESIDUAL}$ onto the mean $Q_{RESIDUAL}$ in boxes over the b,f) sub-polar (50-60N,40W-20W) c,g) subtropical (25-35N,55W-40W) and d,g) NAC (40-50N, 40W-30W) regions. Each of these regions is indicated by boxes in the respective panels. Hatching in a-h) indicates where regression coefficients are statistically significant at the 95% level following a t-test.

 $Q_{RESIDUAL}$ regression shows near zero regression coefficients over the eastern sub-polar North 325 Atlantic (figure 11e), which features prominently in PC2 (figure 6j). Similarly, anomalously high 326 $Q_{RESIDUAL}$ over the eastern sub-polar North Atlantic shows little connection with circulation 327 variability (figure 11b,f). In contrast, negative sub-tropical $Q_{RESIDUAL}$ anomalies are linked to a 328 negative NAO-like pattern (figure 11c,g), similar to $Q_{RESIDUAL}$ PC2 (figure 61). This suggests that 329 it is the sub-tropical / Gulf Stream region which forces the response to $Q_{RESIDUAL}$ PC2 with the 330 sub-polar North Atlantic playing little role. This is consistent with Baker et al. (2019) who found 331 the NAO to be sensitive to SST variability in the western subtropical North Atlantic (see their 332 figure 1). For completeness, high $Q_{RESIDUAL}$ along the NAC, as in PC1, forces a similar pattern 333 to PC1 (compare figure 6k with figure 11d,h), suggesting that the warm NAC is indeed forcing the 334 ridge over the North-east Atlantic. 335



FIG. 12. Regressions of SSTs onto $Q_{RESIDUAL}$ EOFs 1 and 2 in the piControl run and regressions of SST, SLP and U850 onto an index of SST variability in Hist-1950 experiments. The index is the projection of the SSTs in the Hist-1950 onto SST patterns associated with $Q_{RESIDUAL}$ EOFs 1 and 2 in the piControl simulation. Hatching indicates where regression coefficients are statistically significant at the 95% level following a t-test.

Further evidence that the circulation patterns correlated with the $Q_{RESIDUAL}$ PCs are forced by 340 the SSTs is provided by analysis of atmosphere-only simulations. The atmosphere-only simulations, 341 entitled Hist-1950, are run using the same model, but forced with observed SSTs and historical 342 greenhouse gas and aerosol forcings spanning 1950-2014. The SSTs do not react to changes 343 in circulation patterns and hence the direction of causality is clear. There are three ensemble 344 members of Hist-1950 and we take the ensemble average as the SSTs are the same in each case. 345 We project the SST patterns associated with $Q_{RESIDUAL}$ PC1 and PC2 onto SSTs in the Hist-1950 346 simulations, over the North Atlantic box used for the dynamical decomposition (20N-75N,60W-347 0W), and regress SSTs, SLP and zonal wind onto the resulting time series. The piControl and 348 Hist-1950 SST patterns show a reasonable remsemblance (figure 12a,b and figure 12e,f), though 349 the correspondence is imperfect as the Hist-1950 run is forced by observed SSTs, which will have 350 different modes of SST variability. Similar to the piControl simulations, the $Q_{RESIDUAL}$ PC1 351 pattern is associated with a high SLP anomaly over the extratropical North Atlantic, albeit with its 352 centre shifted slightly further west in Hist-1950. The $Q_{RESIDUAL}$ PC2 pattern also shows a similar 353



FIG. 13. Variables regressed onto AMV in the (left) LL and (right) MM versions of HadGEM3-GC3.1. Shown are regressions of 15-year running mean SST, $Q_{RESIDUAL}$ and SLP onto (top) AMV at lag 0, (middle) the AMV index but for the AMV leading by 10 years, (middle) the difference of these (AMV lag 10 minus lag 0) and (bottom) a Gulf Stream index (see text). The box used to define the Gulf Stream index is shown in panels with $Q_{RESIDUAL}$ regressions.

response in Hist-1950 to the piControl, in both cases being characterised by a negative NAO-like
 pattern.

As a final application of the dynamical decomposition method, we analyse the response of 361 HadGEM3-GC3.1 to AMV with differing horizontal resolutions. Lai et al. (2022) showed that the 362 MM version of the model exhibits a negative NAO response following a positive AMV event, while 363 the LL version shows little response (figure 13). For zero lag, both LL and MM versions have the 364 characteristic horseshoe-like SST pattern of AMV and are associated with negative SLP anomalies 365 in the North Atlantic. The negative SLP anomalies are may be associated with the circulation 366 pattern driving the AMV in the first place (whether directly via surface heat fluxes or indirectly 367 via changes to AMOC strength). Ten years after the AMV peak, the LL and MM SST patterns are 368 relatively similar with one difference being in the Gulf Stream region, where MM shows a weak 369 negative SST anomaly. Given their similarity, what is the cause of the difference in circulation 370 responses to AMV? 371

Regressions with $Q_{RESIDUAL}$ reveal more of a difference between the LL and MM simulations 372 at lag 10, again particularly in the Gulf Stream region. The MM run shows a negative $Q_{RESIDUAL}$ 373 anomaly at lag 10 in the boxed region, whereas the LL simulation shows no substantial anomaly. 374 The SST differences between lag 10 and lag 0 for the LL and MM runs again emphasise this 375 difference between the model versions, with a clear difference in the Gulf Stream SST for MM, 376 but none for LL. To provide further evidence that the Gulf Stream anomalies are the reason for the 377 difference in responses to AMV between the different versions, we compute a Gulf Stream index 378 as the mean $Q_{RESIDUAL}$ within the boxed region shown in figure figure 13 (70W-50W,37N-43N) 379 and regress the variables onto this index. For both LL and MM versions, this produces an SLP 380 pattern similar to the AMV lag 10 for MM, with a low pressure anomaly in the mid-latitudes and 381 high pressure north-west of the UK. This is also akin to the observed response to Gulf Stream SST 382 identified by Wills et al. (2016). This analysis suggests that rather than AMV primarily influencing 383 atmospheric circulation via the sub-polar North Atlantic, that it is the Gulf Stream region which 384 plays a leading role, at least in HadGEM3-GC3.1. 385

6. Sensitivity to period length and external forcing

This study has presented the results of applying the circulation analogues method to a piControl 387 run with a long time series and no externally forced variability. It would however be desirable 388 to apply this to historical simulations or reanalysis datasets which are shorter and are subject to 389 variations in greenhouse gases and aerosols. This next section therefore investigates the sensitivity 390 of the method to the length of the period and presence of external forcing. To test the sensitivity 391 to the length of the time period, we perform the dynamical decomposition using five 100-year 392 and three 165-year, non-overlapping subsets of the piControl run. We also apply the dynamical 393 decomposition to a four-member ensemble of runs with observed external forcings spanning 1850-394 2014 (historical), which have been created using the same model. In each case, the same values 395 of N_r , N_a and N_s are used as for the original piControl run. For the historical simulations, the 396 influence of external forcing is removed by linearly regressing out the global-mean SST from all 397 variables before performing the dynamical decomposition. 398

Figure 14 shows the sensitivity of the NAO to forcing by anomalous $Q_{RESIDUAL}$, as in figure 11e), but calculated using subsets of the piControl run and for historical simulations. The 165-



FIG. 14. Uncertainty associated with calculating SST forcing of the NAO using shorter periods of data. Results of regressing $Q_{RESIDUAL}$ onto the NAO are shown for a-c) the piControl run split into three 165-year periods, d-h) the piControl run split into five 100-year periods and i-l) four historical runs using the same model. Hatching indicates where regression coefficients are statistically significant at the 95% level following a t-test. Units are $W/m^2/\sigma$.

year subsets of the piControl are similar to one another and to the results from the full 500-year 406 period. For instance, all show the positive phase of the NAO to be linked to anomalously high 407 $Q_{RESIDUAL}$ over the Gulf Stream, a centre of action at 40W,30N and over the Labrador sea (figure 408 14a-c). The 100-year subsets are also broadly similar to one another, but the strength of the 409 different centres of action varies considerably between periods. The 1850-1949 and 2150-2249 410 periods show a relatively strong forcing of the NAO from the region around 40W,30N, but this 411 correspondence is much weaker and not significant in the other periods (figure 14d-h). Similarly, the 412 historical simulations show roughly similar patterns overall, again with positive NAO-QRESIDUAL 413 correlations around 40W,30N and over the Labrador sea, but with the strength of the connection 414 varying considerably between runs. 415

Performing the EOF analysis of $Q_{RESIDUAL}$ as before, the historical simulations each show similar dominant patterns of $Q_{RESIDUAL}$ variability to the piControl, though for ensemble members r1i1p1f3 and r2i1p1f3 the order of the first two PCs is flipped. This suggests that external forcing



FIG. 15. Regressions of Q and SLP onto the first two PCs of $Q_{RESIDUAL}$ for the four historical ensemble members is shown by colours with the results from the piControl simulations shown by unfilled contours. Hatching indicates where regression coefficients are statistically significant at the 95% level following a t-test.

and the shorter length of the simulations does not prevent identification of the leading modes by 422 which SST impacts the atmosphere. Further, this provides further evidence that the dynamical 423 decomposition could usefully be applied to reanalysis datasets, which have the added complexity of 424 external forcing and are considerably shorter than a typical piControl run. However, only r1i1p1f3 425 PC1, r3i1p1f3 PC1 and r4i1p1f3 PC2 show similar SLP responses to the piControl and indeed 426 r2i1p1f3 PC2 and r4i1p1f3 PC1 show opposite responses, suggesting that the SLP response to the 427 $Q_{RESIDUAL}$ modes is either non-stationary or overwhelmed by internal variability for the shorter 428 simulations. 429

7. Discussion and conclusions

This study has presented a method to remove the direct effects of atmospheric circulation on Q431 and thus reveal a residual component of Q, $Q_{RESIDUAL}$, which is forced by SSTs. The method uses 432 a circulation analogues technique and has been tested using the HadGEM3-GC3.1-MM piControl 433 run for the wintertime North Atlantic. The leading modes of $Q_{RESIDUAL}$ show substantial low 434 frequency variability and the peak of the EOF1 is closlely linked with a strengthening of the 435 AMOC. The modes are characterised by a warming of the atmosphere along the Gulf Stream and 436 North Atlantic Current for the EOF1; and a dipole of Q anomalies with cooling of the atmosphere 437 in the western subtropical North Atlantic and warming in the eastern sub-polar region for EOF2. 438 The first and second modes also drive equivalent barotropic atmospheric circulation responses in 439 the form of Atlantic ridge and negative NAO patterns, respectively. 440

Although beyond the scope of this paper, it would be of interest to apply this method to other regions. For example, Indian Ocean SSTs are strongly affected by atmospheric variability, but also can force atmospheric circulation anomalies. Hence, the dynamical decomposition could provide a useful diagnostic for separating the atmospheric and ocean-driven *Q* patterns in this region. Other regions which could be of interest include the tropical Atlantic and North Pacific.

It should be noted that the dynamical decomposition method is primarily a diagnostic tool, for 446 separating atmospheric and ocean-driven components of Q. That is to say, the atmosphere responds 447 to Q and not $Q_{RESIDUAL}$. O'Reilly et al. (2023) identified differences in the sign of Q anomalies 448 in free-running, coupled model experiments compared with idealised pacemaker experiments. 449 Specifically, restoring tropical Atlantic SSTs towards particular patterns often results in positive Q, 450 though in coupled runs, warm SSTs in this location are usually linked negative Q. The dynamical 451 decomposition method could be of particular use in comparing Q in free-running models to that in 452 pacemaker experiments and thus establishing whether the SST-restoring primarily occurs through 453 atmospheric or oceanic adjustment. 454

This study has also shown that shorter historical simulations, forced by variable greenhouse gases and aerosols, using the same model as for the piControl simulation, produce similar $Q_{RESIDUAL}$ patterns to the piControl. However, the atmospheric circulation response shows considerably more uncertainty in the historical runs. Mid-latitude SST variability which appreciably affects atmospheric circulation, primarily occurs on decadal to multidecadal timescales as the forcing

itself is weak and must therefore be persistent. Hence, even for a 100-year dataset, this may be 460 inadequately sampled. This would therefore suggest that caution should be exercised in studying the 461 circulation response in shorter model runs or reanalyses datasets. Nevertheless, there is significant 462 evidence that the real-world response to mid-latitude SSTs is underestimated in models (Eade 463 et al. 2014; Scaife and Smith 2018; Smith et al. 2020) and that models underestimate the true 464 multidecadal variability of North Atlantic circulation (Simpson et al. 2018; O'Reilly et al. 2021) 465 and hence 100-year long reanalysis datasets may still show an appreciable signal. We aim to 466 examine this in a future paper. 467

468 Acknowledgments.

469 Data availability statement.

470 **References**

⁴⁷¹ Alexander, M. A., and J. D. Scott, 1997: Surface Flux Variability over the North Pa⁴⁷² cific and North Atlantic Oceans. *Journal of Climate*, **10** (**11**), 2963–2978, https://doi.org/
⁴⁷³ 10.1175/1520-0442(1997)010<2963:SFVOTN>2.0.CO;2, URL https://journals.ametsoc.org/
⁴⁷⁴ view/journals/clim/10/11/1520-0442_1997_010_2963_sfvotn_2.0.co_2.xml, publisher: Amer⁴⁷⁵ ican Meteorological Society Section: Journal of Climate.

Baker, H. S., T. Woollings, C. E. Forest, and M. R. Allen, 2019: The Linear Sensitivity of the North Atlantic Oscillation and Eddy-Driven Jet to SSTs. *Journal of Climate*,
32 (19), 6491–6511, https://doi.org/10.1175/JCLI-D-19-0038.1, URL https://journals.ametsoc.
org/view/journals/clim/32/19/jcli-d-19-0038.1.xml, publisher: American Meteorological Society Section: Journal of Climate.

⁴⁸¹ Bishop, S. P., R. J. Small, F. O. Bryan, and R. A. Tomas, 2017: Scale Dependence of Midlatitude Air–Sea Interaction. *Journal of Climate*, **30** (**20**), 8207–8221,
⁴⁸³ https://doi.org/10.1175/JCLI-D-17-0159.1, URL https://journals.ametsoc.org/view/journals/
⁴⁸⁴ clim/30/20/jcli-d-17-0159.1.xml, publisher: American Meteorological Society Section: Journal
⁴⁸⁵ of Climate.

⁴⁸⁶ Blackport, R., J. A. Screen, K. van der Wiel, and R. Bintanja, 2019: Minimal influence of reduced
 ⁴⁸⁷ Arctic sea ice on coincident cold winters in mid-latitudes. *Nature Climate Change*, 9 (9),
 ⁴⁸⁸ 697–704, https://doi.org/10.1038/s41558-019-0551-4, URL https://www.nature.com/articles/
 ⁴⁸⁹ s41558-019-0551-4, number: 9 Publisher: Nature Publishing Group.

Cattiaux, J., R. Vautard, C. Cassou, P. Yiou, V. Masson-Delmotte, and F. Codron, 2010: Winter
 2010 in Europe: A cold extreme in a warming climate. *Geophysical Research Letters*, 37 (20),
 https://doi.org/10.1029/2010GL044613, URL https://onlinelibrary.wiley.com/doi/abs/10.1029/
 2010GL044613, _eprint: https://onlinelibrary.wiley.com/doi/pdf/10.1029/2010GL044613.

⁴⁹⁴ Czaja, A., and C. Frankignoul, 2002: Observed Impact of Atlantic SST Anomalies on ⁴⁹⁵ the North Atlantic Oscillation. *Journal of Climate*, **15** (6), 606–623, https://doi.org/10. ⁴⁹⁶ 1175/1520-0442(2002)015<0606:OIOASA>2.0.CO;2, URL https://journals.ametsoc.org/view/
 ⁴⁹⁷ journals/clim/15/6/1520-0442_2002_015_0606_oioasa_2.0.co_2.xml, publisher: American
 ⁴⁹⁸ Meteorological Society Section: Journal of Climate.

Dawson, A., 2016: eofs: A Library for EOF Analysis of Meteorological, Oceano-499 and Climate Data. 4 (1), e14, https://doi.org/10.5334/jors.122, graphic, URL 500 https://openresearchsoftware.metajnl.com/articles/10.5334/jors.122?utm_source=TrendMD& 501 utm_medium=cpc&utm_campaign=Journal_of_Open_Research_Software_TrendMD_0, 502 number: 1 Publisher: Ubiquity Press. 503

Deser, C., L. Terray, and A. S. Phillips, 2016: Forced and Internal Components of Winter Air
 Temperature Trends over North America during the past 50 Years: Mechanisms and Implica tions. *Journal of Climate*, 29 (6), 2237–2258, https://doi.org/10.1175/JCLI-D-15-0304.1, URL
 https://journals.ametsoc.org/view/journals/clim/29/6/jcli-d-15-0304.1.xml, publisher: Ameri can Meteorological Society Section: Journal of Climate.

Deser, C., and M. S. Timlin, 1997: Atmosphere–Ocean Interaction on Weekly Timescales
 in the North Atlantic and Pacific. *Journal of Climate*, **10** (**3**), 393–408, https://doi.org/
 10.1175/1520-0442(1997)010<0393:AOIOWT>2.0.CO;2, URL https://journals.ametsoc.org/
 view/journals/clim/10/3/1520-0442_1997_010_0393_aoiowt_2.0.co_2.xml, publisher: Amer ican Meteorological Society Section: Journal of Climate.

⁵¹⁴ Deser, C., R. A. Tomas, and S. Peng, 2007: The Transient Atmospheric Circulation Response
⁵¹⁵ to North Atlantic SST and Sea Ice Anomalies. *Journal of Climate*, **20** (**18**), 4751–4767,
⁵¹⁶ https://doi.org/10.1175/JCLI4278.1, URL https://journals.ametsoc.org/view/journals/clim/20/
⁵¹⁷ 18/jcli4278.1.xml, publisher: American Meteorological Society Section: Journal of Climate.

⁵¹⁸ Dong, B., R. T. Sutton, T. Woollings, and K. Hodges, 2013: Variability of the North Atlantic
 ⁵¹⁹ summer storm track: mechanisms and impacts on European climate. *Environmental Research* ⁵²⁰ *Letters*, 8 (3), 034 037, https://doi.org/10.1088/1748-9326/8/3/034037, URL https://dx.doi.org/
 ⁵²¹ 10.1088/1748-9326/8/3/034037, publisher: IOP Publishing.

⁵²² Du, Y., and S.-P. Xie, 2008: Role of atmospheric adjustments in the tropical Indian Ocean ⁵²³ warming during the 20th century in climate models. *Geophysical Research Letters*, **35** (**8**), https://doi.org/10.1029/2008GL033631, URL https://onlinelibrary.wiley.com/doi/abs/10.1029/
 2008GL033631, _eprint: https://onlinelibrary.wiley.com/doi/pdf/10.1029/2008GL033631.

526 Duchon, C. E., 1979: Lanczos Filtering in One and Two Dimensions. Journal of Applied Meteorol-

⁵²⁷ ogy and Climatology, **18** (**8**), 1016–1022, https://doi.org/10.1175/1520-0450(1979)018<1016:

LFIOAT>2.0.CO;2, URL https://journals.ametsoc.org/view/journals/apme/18/8/1520-0450_

⁵²⁹ 1979_018_1016_lfioat_2_0_co_2.xml, publisher: American Meteorological Society Section:

⁵³⁰ Journal of Applied Meteorology and Climatology.

Eade, R., D. Smith, A. Scaife, E. Wallace, N. Dunstone, L. Hermanson, and N. Robin son, 2014: Do seasonal-to-decadal climate predictions underestimate the predictability of
 the real world? *Geophysical Research Letters*, **41** (**15**), 5620–5628, https://doi.org/10.
 1002/2014GL061146, URL https://onlinelibrary.wiley.com/doi/abs/10.1002/2014GL061146,
 _eprint: https://onlinelibrary.wiley.com/doi/pdf/10.1002/2014GL061146.

Ferreira, D., and C. Frankignoul, 2005: The Transient Atmospheric Response to Midlatitude
 SST Anomalies. *Journal of Climate*, 18 (7), 1049–1067, https://doi.org/10.1175/JCLI-3313.1,
 URL https://journals.ametsoc.org/view/journals/clim/18/7/jcli-3313.1.xml, publisher: Ameri can Meteorological Society Section: Journal of Climate.

Gastineau, G., F. D'Andrea, and C. Frankignoul, 2013: Atmospheric response to the North Atlantic
 Ocean variability on seasonal to decadal time scales. *Climate Dynamics*, 40 (9), 2311–2330,
 https://doi.org/10.1007/s00382-012-1333-0, URL https://doi.org/10.1007/s00382-012-1333-0.

Gulev, S. K., M. Latif, N. Keenlyside, W. Park, and K. P. Koltermann, 2013: North Atlantic
Ocean control on surface heat flux on multidecadal timescales. *Nature*, 499 (7459), 464–467,
https://doi.org/10.1038/nature12268, URL https://www.nature.com/articles/nature12268, number: 7459 Publisher: Nature Publishing Group.

Hardiman, S. C., N. J. Dunstone, A. A. Scaife, D. M. Smith, R. Comer, Y. Nie, and H.-L. Ren, 2022:
Missing eddy feedback may explain weak signal-to-noise ratios in climate predictions. *npj Cli- mate and Atmospheric Science*, 5 (1), 1–8, https://doi.org/10.1038/s41612-022-00280-4, URL
https://www.nature.com/articles/s41612-022-00280-4, number: 1 Publisher: Nature Publishing
Group.

He. С., A. C. Clement, M. A. Cane, L. N. Murphy, J. M. Klavans, and 552 T. M. Fenske, 2022: A North Atlantic Warming Hole Without Ocean Circu-553 e2022GL100420, lation. Geophysical Research Letters, 49 (19), https://doi.org/10. 554 1029/2022GL100420, URL https://onlinelibrary.wiley.com/doi/abs/10.1029/2022GL100420, 555 _eprint: https://onlinelibrary.wiley.com/doi/pdf/10.1029/2022GL100420. 556

⁵⁵⁷ Hendon, H. H., and D. L. Hartmann, 1982: Stationary Waves on a Sphere: Sensitivity to
⁵⁵⁸ Thermal Feedback. *Journal of the Atmospheric Sciences*, **39** (**9**), 1906–1920, https://doi.org/
⁵⁵⁹ 10.1175/1520-0469(1982)039<1906:SWOASS>2.0.CO;2, URL https://journals.ametsoc.org/
⁵⁶⁰ view/journals/atsc/39/9/1520-0469_1982_039_1906_swoass_2_0_co_2.xml, publisher: Amer⁵⁶¹ ican Meteorological Society Section: Journal of the Atmospheric Sciences.

Hersbach, H., and Coauthors, 2020: The ERA5 global reanalysis. *Quarterly Jour- nal of the Royal Meteorological Society*, **146** (**730**), 1999–2049, https://doi.org/
10.1002/qj.3803, URL https://onlinelibrary.wiley.com/doi/abs/10.1002/qj.3803, _eprint:
https://onlinelibrary.wiley.com/doi/pdf/10.1002/qj.3803.

Hoskins, B. J., and D. J. Karoly, 1981: The Steady Linear Response of a Spherical Atmosphere to Thermal and Orographic Forcing. *Journal of the Atmospheric Sciences*,
38 (6), 1179–1196, https://doi.org/10.1175/1520-0469(1981)038<1179:TSLROA>2.0.CO;2,
URL https://journals.ametsoc.org/view/journals/atsc/38/6/1520-0469_1981_038_1179_tslroa_
2_0_co_2.xml, publisher: American Meteorological Society Section: Journal of the Atmospheric Sciences.

Khatri, H., R. G. Williams, T. Woollings, and D. M. Smith, 2022: Fast and Slow
Subpolar Ocean Responses to the North Atlantic Oscillation: Thermal and Dynamical Changes. *Geophysical Research Letters*, 49 (24), e2022GL101480, https://doi.org/10.
1029/2022GL101480, URL https://onlinelibrary.wiley.com/doi/abs/10.1029/2022GL101480,
_eprint: https://onlinelibrary.wiley.com/doi/pdf/10.1029/2022GL101480.

Knight, J. R., C. K. Folland, and A. A. Scaife, 2006: Climate impacts of the Atlantic Multidecadal Oscillation. *Geophysical Research Letters*, 33 (17), https://doi.org/10.
1029/2006GL026242, URL https://onlinelibrary.wiley.com/doi/abs/10.1029/2006GL026242,
eprint: https://onlinelibrary.wiley.com/doi/pdf/10.1029/2006GL026242.

Kushnir, Y., W. A. Robinson, I. Bladé, N. M. J. Hall, S. Peng, and R. Sutton, 2002: Atmo spheric GCM Response to Extratropical SST Anomalies: Synthesis and Evaluation. *Journal of Climate*, 15 (16), 2233–2256, https://doi.org/10.1175/1520-0442(2002)015<2233:AGRTES>

⁵⁸⁴ 2.0.CO;2, URL https://journals.ametsoc.org/view/journals/clim/15/16/1520-0442_2002_015_

⁵⁸⁵ 2233_agrtes_2.0.co_2.xml, publisher: American Meteorological Society Section: Journal of ⁵⁸⁶ Climate.

Lai, W. K. M., J. I. Robson, L. J. Wilcox, and N. Dunstone, 2022: Mechanisms of In ternal Atlantic Multidecadal Variability in HadGEM3-GC3.1 at Two Different Resolutions.
 Journal of Climate, 35 (4), 1365–1383, https://doi.org/10.1175/JCLI-D-21-0281.1, URL
 https://journals.ametsoc.org/view/journals/clim/35/4/JCLI-D-21-0281.1.xml, publisher: Amer ican Meteorological Society Section: Journal of Climate.

Lorenz, E. N., 1969: Atmospheric Predictability as Revealed by Naturally Occurring Analogues. *Journal of the Atmospheric Sciences*, **26** (**4**), 636–646, https://doi.org/10. 1175/1520-0469(1969)26<636:APARBN>2.0.CO;2, URL https://journals.ametsoc.org/view/ journals/atsc/26/4/1520-0469_1969_26_636_aparbn_2_0_co_2.xml, publisher: American Meteorological Society Section: Journal of the Atmospheric Sciences.

Meehl, G. A., and Coauthors, 2021: Initialized Earth System prediction from subseasonal to
 decadal timescales. *Nature Reviews Earth & Environment*, 2 (5), 340–357, https://doi.org/10.
 1038/s43017-021-00155-x, URL https://www.nature.com/articles/s43017-021-00155-x, num ber: 5 Publisher: Nature Publishing Group.

Mehta, V. M., M. J. Suarez, J. V. Manganello, and T. L. Delworth, 2000: Oceanic influ ence on the North Atlantic Oscillation and associated northern hemisphere climate vari ations: 1959–1993. *Geophysical Research Letters*, 27 (1), 121–124, https://doi.org/10.
 1029/1999GL002381, URL https://onlinelibrary.wiley.com/doi/abs/10.1029/1999GL002381,
 _eprint: https://onlinelibrary.wiley.com/doi/pdf/10.1029/1999GL002381.

Menary, M. B., D. L. R. Hodson, J. I. Robson, R. T. Sutton, and R. A. Wood, 2015: A Mechanism
 of Internal Decadal Atlantic Ocean Variability in a High-Resolution Coupled Climate Model.
 Journal of Climate, 28 (19), 7764–7785, https://doi.org/10.1175/JCLI-D-15-0106.1, URL

https://journals.ametsoc.org/view/journals/clim/28/19/jcli-d-15-0106.1.xml, publisher: Amer ican Meteorological Society Section: Journal of Climate.

Menary, M. B., L. C. Jackson, and M. S. Lozier, 2020: Reconciling the Relationship Between the AMOC and Labrador Sea in OSNAP Observations and Climate Models. *Geophysical Research Letters*, 47 (18), e2020GL089793, https://doi.org/10.
1029/2020GL089793, URL https://onlinelibrary.wiley.com/doi/abs/10.1029/2020GL089793,
_eprint: https://onlinelibrary.wiley.com/doi/pdf/10.1029/2020GL089793.

Menary, M. B., and Coauthors, 2018: Preindustrial Control Simulations With HadGEM3GC3.1 for CMIP6. *Journal of Advances in Modeling Earth Systems*, 10 (12), 3049–3075,
https://doi.org/10.1029/2018MS001495, URL https://onlinelibrary.wiley.com/doi/abs/10.1029/
2018MS001495, _eprint: https://onlinelibrary.wiley.com/doi/pdf/10.1029/2018MS001495.

Merryfield, W. J., and Coauthors, 2020: Current and Emerging Developments in Subseasonal
 to Decadal Prediction. *Bulletin of the American Meteorological Society*, **101** (6), E869–E896,
 https://doi.org/10.1175/BAMS-D-19-0037.1, URL https://journals.ametsoc.org/view/journals/
 bams/101/6/bamsD190037.xml, publisher: American Meteorological Society Section: Bulletin
 of the American Meteorological Society.

Novak, L., M. H. P. Ambaum, and R. Tailleux, 2015: The Life Cycle of the North Atlantic
 Storm Track. *Journal of the Atmospheric Sciences*, 72 (2), 821–833, https://doi.org/10.1175/
 JAS-D-14-0082.1, URL https://journals.ametsoc.org/view/journals/atsc/72/2/jas-d-14-0082.1.
 xml, publisher: American Meteorological Society Section: Journal of the Atmospheric Sciences.

O'Reilly, C. H., D. J. Befort, A. Weisheimer, T. Woollings, A. Ballinger, and G. Hegerl, 2021:
 Projections of northern hemisphere extratropical climate underestimate internal variability and
 associated uncertainty. *Communications Earth & Environment*, 2 (1), 1–9, https://doi.org/10.
 1038/s43247-021-00268-7, URL https://www.nature.com/articles/s43247-021-00268-7, num-

⁶³³ ber: 1 Publisher: Nature Publishing Group.

⁶³⁴ O'Reilly, C. H., M. Huber, T. Woollings, and L. Zanna, 2016: The signature of ⁶³⁵ low-frequency oceanic forcing in the Atlantic Multidecadal Oscillation. *Geophys-*⁶³⁶ *ical Research Letters*, **43** (**6**), 2810–2818, https://doi.org/10.1002/2016GL067925,

31

- URL https://onlinelibrary.wiley.com/doi/abs/10.1002/2016GL067925, _eprint: 637 https://onlinelibrary.wiley.com/doi/pdf/10.1002/2016GL067925. 638
- O'Reilly, C. H., M. Patterson, J. Robson, P. A. Monerie, D. Hodson, and Y. Ruprich-Robert, 639 2023: Challenges with interpreting the impact of Atlantic Multidecadal Variability using SST-640 restoring experiments. npj Climate and Atmospheric Science, 6 (1), 1–12, https://doi.org/10. 641
- 1038/s41612-023-00335-0, URL https://www.nature.com/articles/s41612-023-00335-0, num-642
- ber: 1 Publisher: Nature Publishing Group. 643
- O'Reilly, C. H., T. Woollings, and L. Zanna, 2017: The Dynamical Influence of the Atlantic 644 Multidecadal Oscillation on Continental Climate. Journal of Climate, 30 (18), 7213-7230, 645 https://doi.org/10.1175/JCLI-D-16-0345.1, URL https://journals.ametsoc.org/view/journals/ 646 clim/30/18/jcli-d-16-0345.1.xml, publisher: American Meteorological Society Section: Journal 647 of Climate. 648
- O'Reilly, C. H., L. Zanna, and T. Woollings, 2019: Assessing External and Internal Sources 649 of Atlantic Multidecadal Variability Using Models, Proxy Data, and Early Instrumental In-650 dices. Journal of Climate, 32 (22), 7727–7745, https://doi.org/10.1175/JCLI-D-19-0177.1, URL 651 https://journals.ametsoc.org/view/journals/clim/32/22/jcli-d-19-0177.1.xml, publisher: Ameri-652

can Meteorological Society Section: Journal of Climate. 653

657

- Rodwell, M. J., D. P. Rowell, and C. K. Folland, 1999: Oceanic forcing of the wintertime 654 North Atlantic Oscillation and European climate. Nature, 398 (6725), 320-323, https://doi.org/ 655 10.1038/18648, URL https://www.nature.com/articles/18648, number: 6725 Publisher: Nature 656 Publishing Group.
- Årthun, M., and T. Eldevik, 2016: On Anomalous Ocean Heat Transport toward the Arctic and 658
- Associated Climate Predictability. Journal of Climate, 29 (2), 689-704, https://doi.org/10.1175/ 659
- JCLI-D-15-0448.1, URL https://journals.ametsoc.org/view/journals/clim/29/2/jcli-d-15-0448. 660
- 1.xml, publisher: American Meteorological Society Section: Journal of Climate. 661
- Årthun, M., T. Eldevik, E. Viste, H. Drange, T. Furevik, H. L. Johnson, and N. S. Keenly-662
- side, 2017: Skillful prediction of northern climate provided by the ocean. Nature Commu-663
- nications, 8 (1), 15 875, https://doi.org/10.1038/ncomms15875, URL https://www.nature.com/ 664
- articles/ncomms15875, number: 1 Publisher: Nature Publishing Group. 665

Scaife, A. A., and D. Smith, 2018: A signal-to-noise paradox in climate science. *npj Climate and Atmospheric Science*, 1 (1), 1–8, https://doi.org/10.1038/s41612-018-0038-4, URL https://
 www.nature.com/articles/s41612-018-0038-4, number: 1 Publisher: Nature Publishing Group.

Scaife, A. A., and Coauthors, 2019: Does increased atmospheric resolution im prove seasonal climate predictions? *Atmospheric Science Letters*, 20 (8), e922,
 https://doi.org/10.1002/asl.922, URL https://onlinelibrary.wiley.com/doi/abs/10.1002/asl.922,
 __eprint: https://onlinelibrary.wiley.com/doi/pdf/10.1002/asl.922.

Simpson, I. R., C. Deser, K. A. McKinnon, and E. A. Barnes, 2018: Modeled and Observed Multidecadal Variability in the North Atlantic Jet Stream and Its Connection to Sea Surface Temperatures. *Journal of Climate*, **31 (20)**, 8313–8338, https://doi.org/10.1175/JCLI-D-18-0168.1, URL
https://journals.ametsoc.org/view/journals/clim/31/20/jcli-d-18-0168.1.xml, publisher: American Meteorological Society Section: Journal of Climate.

Smith, D. M., and Coauthors, 2020: North Atlantic climate far more predictable than models
imply. *Nature*, 583 (7818), 796–800, https://doi.org/10.1038/s41586-020-2525-0, URL https:
//www.nature.com/articles/s41586-020-2525-0, number: 7818 Publisher: Nature Publishing
Group.

Sutton, R. T., and B. Dong, 2012: Atlantic Ocean influence on a shift in European climate
 in the 1990s. *Nature Geoscience*, 5 (11), 788–792, https://doi.org/10.1038/ngeo1595, URL
 https://www.nature.com/articles/ngeo1595, number: 11 Publisher: Nature Publishing Group.

Sutton, R. T., and D. L. R. Hodson, 2007: Climate Response to Basin-Scale Warming and Cooling
 of the North Atlantic Ocean. *Journal of Climate*, 20 (5), 891–907, https://doi.org/10.1175/
 JCLI4038.1, URL https://journals.ametsoc.org/view/journals/clim/20/5/jcli4038.1.xml, pub lisher: American Meteorological Society Section: Journal of Climate.

Titchner, H. A., and N. A. Rayner, 2014: The Met Office Hadley Centre sea ice and sea surface temperature data set, version 2: 1. Sea ice concentrations. *Journal of Geophysical Research: Atmospheres*, **119** (6), 2864–2889, https://doi.org/10.1002/ 2013JD020316, URL https://onlinelibrary.wiley.com/doi/abs/10.1002/2013JD020316, _eprint: https://onlinelibrary.wiley.com/doi/pdf/10.1002/2013JD020316.

33

van den Dool, H., J. Huang, and Y. Fan, 2003: Performance and analysis of
the constructed analogue method applied to U.S. soil moisture over 1981–2001. *Journal of Geophysical Research: Atmospheres*, 108 (D16), https://doi.org/10.1029/
2002JD003114, URL https://onlinelibrary.wiley.com/doi/abs/10.1029/2002JD003114, _eprint:
https://onlinelibrary.wiley.com/doi/pdf/10.1029/2002JD003114.

van den Dool, H. M., 1994: Searching for analogues, how long must we wait? *Tellus A: Dynamic Meteorology and Oceanography*, 46 (3), 314–324, https://doi.org/10.3402/tellusa.
 v46i3.15481, URL http://a.tellusjournals.se/article/10.3402/tellusa.v46i3.15481/, number: 3
 Publisher: Stockholm University Press.

Wallace, J. M., Q. Fu, B. V. Smoliak, P. Lin, and C. M. Johanson, 2012: Simulated versus
observed patterns of warming over the extratropical Northern Hemisphere continents during the cold season. *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences*, **109** (**36**), 14337–
14342, https://doi.org/10.1073/pnas.1204875109, URL https://www.pnas.org/doi/full/10.1073/
pnas.1204875109, publisher: Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences.

Williams, K. D., and Coauthors, 2018: The Met Office Global Coupled Model 3.0 and 3.1 (GC3.0 and GC3.1) Configurations. *Journal of Advances in Modeling Earth Systems*, **10** (2), 357–380, https://doi.org/10.1002/2017MS001115, URL https://onlinelibrary.wiley.com/doi/abs/10.1002/2017MS001115, 2017MS001115, _eprint: https://onlinelibrary.wiley.com/doi/pdf/10.1002/2017MS001115.

Wills, S. M., D. W. J. Thompson, and L. M. Ciasto, 2016: On the Observed Relationships between Variability in Gulf Stream Sea Surface Temperatures and the Atmospheric Circulation over the North Atlantic. *Journal of Climate*, 29 (10), 3719–3730, https://doi.org/10.1175/JCLI-D-15-0820.1, URL https://journals.ametsoc.org/view/journals/clim/29/10/jcli-d-15-0820.1.xml, publisher: American Meteorological Society Section: Journal of Climate.

Zhang, R., R. Sutton, G. Danabasoglu, Y.-O. Kwon, R. Marsh, S. G. Yeager,
D. E. Amrhein, and C. M. Little, 2019: A Review of the Role of the Atlantic Meridional Overturning Circulation in Atlantic Multidecadal Variability and Associated Climate Impacts. *Reviews of Geophysics*, 57 (2), 316–375, https://doi.org/10.

1029/2019RG000644, URL https://onlinelibrary.wiley.com/doi/abs/10.1029/2019RG000644,
 _eprint: https://onlinelibrary.wiley.com/doi/pdf/10.1029/2019RG000644.